Date: 20070501

Docket: T-1927-06

Citation: 2007 FC 467

[ENGLISH TRANSLATION]

Montréal, Quebec, May 1, 2007

PRESENT: Richard Morneau, Esq., Prothonotary

ADMIRALTY ACTION IN PERSONAM

BETWEEN:

A.P. MOLLER - MAERSK A/S TRADING AS MAERSK SEALAND

Plaintiff

and

MARITIME-ONTARIO FREIGHT LINES LIMITED

Defendant

REASONS FOR ORDER AND ORDER

[1] **GIVEN** this motion by the defendant (hereinafter Maritime-Ontario) under Rule 105(b) of the *Federal Court Rules* (the Rules) to have a stay ordered in this case until the outcome of the action in docket T-2143-04 is determined;

- [2] **GIVEN** that the relationship between this docket, T-1927-06 and docket T-2143-04 has thus been summarized by the Court in its decision on February 7, 2007, when it refused to consolidate the two dockets:
 - [2] In this docket, T-1927-06, Maersk is acting as a plaintiff and commenced an action against Maritime-Ontario on November 3, 2006, so that the latter corporation would ultimately be held responsible for damages that Maersk might suffer due the action commenced by Lagoon Seafood in docket T-2143-04.
 - [3] In docket T-2143-04, it should essentially be known that Lagoon Seafood accuses Maersk of ultimately having delivered a shipment of fish in a damaged state. Maersk considers that it is because of the shipment inspection conducted by Maritime-Ontario that that shipment deteriorated. Hence Maersk's action in T-1927-06.
- [3] **GIVEN** that the consolidation of the two dockets was dismissed because, among other things, docket T-2143-04 was virtually ready for trial (and was in fact held on June 18, 2007), the application to combine the dockets was filed late and this docket, T-1927-06, had to develop normally;
- [4] **GIVEN** that, at the hearing for the motion by Maersk regarding the consolidation of the two files, Maritime-Ontario did not indicate its intent to appeal under Rule 105(*b*) and did not submit its motion record under review until April 11, 2007;

- [5] **GIVEN**, therefore, that this motion by Maritime-Ontario is essentially late and that the Court cannot retain any valid and serious reasons that would explain why this motion was not filed earlier;
- [6] **GIVEN** that a stay in this docket would prevent this docket from proceeding to its current stage, i.e. examination for discovery;
- [7] **GIVEN** that avoiding examination on discovery of the Maritime-Ontario representative would essentially represent financial savings if this action were not pursued as a result of the outcome of the action in docket T-2143-04;
- [8] **GIVEN** that the Court cannot see here that Maritime-Ontario would be prejudiced to the extent of an injustice or oppression (see the criteria retained by this Court in situations presenting aspects similar to this case, in *Compulife Software Inc.* v. *Computifice Software Inc.* (1997), 143 F.T.R. 19, at para 15; *Mon-Oil Ltd.* v. *R.* 1989 CarswellNat 153, at para 4), if it were to comply now before the proceedings in docket T-2143-04 at the stage of examination for discovery;
- [9] **GIVEN** the reasons above, the following order is issued:

ORDER

1	The motion	ary Manitima	Ontonio	undan Dula	105(b)	:. 4:	booken	with agata
1.	The mouon	ov ivraritime	-Omano	under Ruie	103(0)	is an	siilisseu.	with costs.

 Maritime-Ontario shall submit its representative to examination for discovery at a location in Montréal and on a date to be decided on consent between the parties, but that must nonetheless be on or before May 11, 2007.

"Richard Morneau"
Prothonotary

FEDERAL COURT

SOLICITORS OF RECORD

DOCKET: T-1927-06

STYLE OF CAUSE: A.P. MOLLER - MAERSK A/S TRADING AS

MAERSK SEALAND

Plaintiff

MARITIME-ONTARIO FREIGHT LINES LIMITED

Defendant

PLACE OF HEARING: Montréal, Quebec

DATE OF HEARING: April 23, 2007

REASONS FOR ORDER

AND ORDER: PROTHONOTARY RICHARD MORNEAU

DATED: May 1, 2007

APPEARANCES:

Jean-Marie Fontaine FOR THE PLAINTIFF

Alberto Martinez FOR THE DEFENDANT

SOLICITORS OF RECORD:

Borden Ladner Gervais LLP FOR THE PLAINTIFF

Montréal, Quebec

Deslauriers Jeansonne LLP FOR THE DEFENDANT

Montréal, Quebec